



3 1761 10084149 3

The materials produced herein are intended  
are intended for the sole use  
of students at McGill, Toronto  
and Windsor.

CASES AND MATERIALS ON FAMILY LAW

edited by

Bernard Green

September 1977

VOLUME I

LAW LIBRARY

MAR 27 1978

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

The materials produced herein are intended  
are intended for the sole use  
of students at McGill, Toronto  
and Windsor.

CASES AND MATERIALS ON FAMILY LAW

edited by

Bernard Green

September 1977

VOLUME I



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/casesmaterialson01gree>

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	2
I The Constitutional Framework	2
II The Legislative Framework	2
III The Institutional Framework	2
A. The courts	2
B. Other agencies	2
C. The lawyer	2
<i>Reisman, Beyond the Call of Obvious Duty</i>	3
<i>Freeman and Freeman, Lawyers Cannot Avoid Counselling</i>	6
IV Some Views on Marriage	13
<i>Rudikoff, Marriage and Household</i>	13
<i>Ryan, Maintenance Obligations in a New Legal Concept of Marriage</i>	21
CHAPTER TWO: FORMATION OF THE FAMILY UNIT AND ANNULMENT	25
I Introduction	25
II The Constitutional Issue	26
<i>Kerr</i>	26
III The Statutory Conditions	30
A. License and formalities	30
<i>The Marriage Act</i>	30
B. Effect of failure to comply with statutory conditions	34
<i>The Marriage Act</i>	34
<i>Friend, "Common Law Marriage in Ontario"</i>	34
<i>Alspector</i>	38
<i>Friend, "Common Law Marriage in Ontario"</i>	39
C. Age and parental consent	41
<i>The Marriage Act</i>	41
<i>Re Fox</i>	44
IV The Conditions Imposed By The Common Law	46
A. Introduction	46
B. A man and a woman ...	46
<i>Baker v. Nelson</i>	46
<i>North v. Matheson</i>	48
<i>M.T. v. J.T.</i>	51
C. ... Who are free to marry ...	54
<i>Re Perry</i>	54
<i>The Marriage Act</i>	55

D. ... who consent to marry each other ...	56
(1) Mental capacity	56
The Marriage Act	56
Chertkow v. Feinstein	57
Whitaker v. McNeilly	64
(2) Mistake	67
(a) As to the nature of the ceremony	67
Nane v. Sykiotis	67
(b) As to the effect of the ceremony	69
Kenward	69
(3) Mental reservations	75
Gardner	75
(4) Duress	77
Thompson	77
(5) Fraud	82
Moss	82
H. v. C.	85
E. ... and who are able to consummate the marriage	87
(1) What constitutes consummation	87
Baxter	87
Wilkinson	90
(2) Inability to consummate	92
(a) Physical	92
Foster	92
(b) "Invincible repugnance"	94
Heil	94
Greenlees	96
Foisy	97
Szrejher	99
V Defences To A Nullity Action	101
A. Knowledge	101
G. v. G. (otherwise H)	101
B. v. B.	105
B. Conduct	106
R.E.L.	106
W. v. W.	111

C. Delay and improper motive	114
Clifford	114
J. v. J.	118
D. The effect of petitioner's own impotence	119
Pettit	119
VI The Nullity Decree	123
A. Jurisdiction	123
The Annulment of Marriages Act	123
Rose	123
B. Conflicts problems	124
C. Economic consequences	124
D. Children	124
VII Reform: The English Approach	125
Gretney, "The Nullity of Marriage Act 1971"	125
CHAPTER THREE: DIVORCE	129
I Grounds	129
A. General	129
Green, "The Divorce Act of 1968"	129
Divorce Act	130
B. Immediate relief: the fault grounds	131
(1) Adultery	131
(a) What it is	131
Orford	131
Dennis	133
(b) Proving adultery	134
(i) Standard of proof	134
Smith	134
(ii) Methods	136
1. Physical condition	136
M. v. M.	136
Preston-Jones	138
Himmelman	140
2. Circumstances	142
Downie	142
Little	145

3. Admissions	149
Divorce Act	149
Ewasuik	150
Veysey	151
The Evidence Act	152
Rosen, "The Privilege Against Self-Incrimination as to Adultery - Should It Be Abolished?"	153
Rayner	155
Hunter	155
4. Other decrees	156
Love	156
Meshwa	158
(2) Other sexual misconduct	160
Divorce Act	160
T. v. T.	161
G. v. G.	167
M. v. M.	169
T. v. T. and W.	170
(3) Cruelty	172
Divorce Act	173
(a) Relevance of the common law alimony standard	173
Bagshaw	173
N. v. N.	178
Feldman	182
Mildon	184
(b) Grave and weighty conduct	186
Wittstock	186
Shumila	190
Hattie	193
(c) The relevance of intention	194
Gollins	194
Sheldon	208
(d) The problem of "mutual cruelty"	210
Driscoll	210
Kelly	211
(e) The time problem	213
C. Delayed relief: marital breakdown	214
Divorce Act	214
(a) Introduction	216
(b) "Separate and apart" ...	216
J.B. v. A.W.B.	216
Dorchester	220
Lachman	221
(c) ... "without just cause" ...	225
Nutley	225
Sullivan	227
Struk	230
G. v. G.	231

	<u>Page</u>
Hogben	234
Bird	237
Marsden	239
Slon	244
 (d) "... and with the intention to remain apart permanently ..."	246
Lilley	246
Kaczmarz	250
Price	253
 (e) Termination of desertion	256
Stephens	256
Richards	258
March	260
 D. Proposals for reform	261
Goldstein & Gitter, <i>On Abolition of Grounds for Divorce</i>	261
 II Bars and Defences	266
A. The possibility of reconciliation	266
Divorce Act	266
Irving & Irving, <i>Conciliation Counselling In Divorce Litigation</i>	267
 B. Absolute bars applicable to all grounds	272
(1) Collusion	272
Divorce Act	272
Sopinka, "The Divorce Act 1968, Collusion Confined"	273
Prockiw	278
Johnson	280
Mandolidis	282
(2) Fraud	284
Fromovitz	284
Gomez	287
 C. Discretionary bars applicable only to s. 3 grounds	288
(1) Connivance	288
Divorce Act	288
Report of the Special Joint Committee ... on Divorce	289
(a) Consent	289
Peters	289
Rumbelow	291
(b) Passive acquiescence: investigation	293
Pearl	293
Hechter	294
(c) Termination of connivance	299
Godfrey	299
(2) Condonation	301
(a) Introduction	301
Divorce Act	302

(b) The common law	303
(i) Knowledge, forgiveness and re-instatement	303
Leaderhouse	303
Vance	308
Henderson	314
Saunders	317
(ii) Revival	318
Graves	318
Schumann	321
(c) The effect of the Divorce Act	324
Divorce Act	324
Cherinski	324
Armstrong	325
Blackburn	328
Brown	329
Nielsen	333
Blue	336
(3) The exercise of discretion	337
The Divorce Act	337
Blunt	338
D. Special bars applicable only to s. 4 grounds	340
The Divorce Act	340
Raggett	341
Savage	344
E. The problem of insanity	346
B. v. B.	346
III Nature and Consequences of Divorce	348
A. Jurisdiction	348
The Divorce Act	348
D. Mendes da Costa, Some Comments on the Conflict of Laws Provisions of the Divorce Act, 1968	349
B. Recognition	353
The Divorce Act	353
Mendes da Costa, Some Comments on the Conflict of Laws Provisions of the Divorce Act	353
C. Consequences	359
(1) Status	359
The Divorce Act	359
(2) Economic: see Chapter Four	360
(3) Children: see Chapter Five	360

CHAPTER FOUR: ECONOMIC RELATIONS BETWEEN HUSBAND AND WIFE	361
I Introduction	361
Friedman, a Comparative Analysis	361
II Ownership of Property	368
A. Introduction	368
Married Women's Property Act	368
Family Law Reform Act 1975	369
B. The concepts: outlined	374
Gissing	374
Thompson	384
Jackman	387
C. The concepts - applied	390
(1) Finding a resulting trust	390
(a) Contributions and intention	390
Kearney	390
Cuthbert	391
Trueman	392
Murdoch	395
Davis	403
(b) Partnership	408
Faye	408
Marx	410
D. Prospects for reform	412
Law Reform Commission of Canada, Family Property	412
III The Wife as a Separate Person	421
Family Law Reform Act, 1975	421
Family Law Reform Act, 1976	423
A. Interspousal torts	424
Family Law Reform Act, 1975	424
B. The married woman's right to earnings	425
Hoddinott	425
IV Mutual Duty of Maintenance	430
A. While married	430
(1) Agency	430
(a) Of cohabitation	430
Family Law Reform Act, 1976	430
Robert Simpson Co. Ltd. v. Ruggles	437
Hatfield Hall v. Walters and MacDonald	440
(2) Alimony	441
(a) Introduction	441
Johnson	442

	<u>Page</u>
(b) Interim alimony and disbursements	446
Griffith	446
Sharp	447
(c) Factors used in computing amount of award	449
(d) Some special problems: arrears and consent judgments	449
(i) Arrears	449
Kergan	449
(ii) Consent judgments	450
Yates	451
(3) The spouse's rights on desertion to an economic remedy	454
(a) General	454
(b) Maintenance legislation for deserted wives	454
The Deserted Wives' and Children's Maintenance Act	454
Criminal Code	456
Family Court: Forum for Poor People	457
Auchinvole	459
MacIntyre	460
Serravella	461
Yewchyn	462
(c) The deserted spouse's rights in relation to the matrimonial home	463
(i) The right to remain where the spouse is not owner	463
National Provincial Bank, Ltd. v. Ainsworth	463
The Matrimonial Homes Act	466
Jones	469
(ii) The right to remain where the spouse has a property interest	471
The Partition Act	471
Family Law Reform Act, 1976	471
Silverman, The Deserted Wife's Dilemma	474
Rush	478
Hearty	480
Silverman, The Deserted Wife's Dilemma	482
Re Maskewycz	485
(d) The wife's right to welfare	492
(i) Short term help	492
Annual Report, Department of Social and Family Services for the Fiscal Year Ending March 1971	492
The General Welfare Assistance Act	493
(ii) Long term help	497
Annual Report, Department of Social and Family Services for the Fiscal Year Ending March 1971	497
The Family Benefits Act	498
Diamond, Philosophy of Welfare	502
Why 29,000 face a Welfare W-A-I-T	506

	<u>Page</u>
B. On dissolution of the marriage	508
(1) By law	508
(a) Whether relief can be granted	508
(i) Nullity	508
The Matrimonial Causes Act	508
Family Law Reform Act, 1976	508
Barnet	510
Ambrose	511
Sealey	512
(ii) Divorce	514
Law Reform Commission of Canada, Maintenance or Divorce	514
The Divorce Act	519
Zacks	520
Lapointe v. Clint	522
Fiedler	523
Kravetsky	524
Van Zyderveld	525
(b) Whether relief should be granted	529
(i) General	529
Tucci	529
(ii) Forms of relief	530
1. Secured order	530
The Matrimonial Causes Act	530
The Divorce Act	530
2. Lump sum	531
The Matrimonial Causes Act	531
The Divorce Act	531
K v. K	531
Maynard	534
Murdoch	535
Shaffran	540
Feldman	541
Ceicko	542
Brett	544
3. Periodic payments	546
Davis	546
Porter	549
Sharpe	551
Williams	553
Parker	555
(iii) Right of the husband to maintenance	558
Cohen	558
(c) Variation of awards	560
Ramsay	560
Johnstone	560
McQuilkin v. Dawson	562
Kinghorn	564
Neal	566
Jancou	568

(2) By death	571
The Dower Act	571
The Devolution of Estates Act	572
The Dependents' Relief Act	573
Succession Law Reform Act, 1976	575
Chernoff	581
C. Special problems: contracting out and election of remedies	582
(1) Contracting out	582
Kerbel, Contracting Out of the Right to Further Support in Separation Agreements	582
Smith	586
Kowaliuk	588
Re Whitelock	589
Olin v. Perrin	592
Re Carey	593
Re Chugg	594
(2) Election of remedies	596
Findlay	596
Roswell	597
Armich	598
Family Law Reform Act, 1976	599
CHAPTER FIVE: CHILDREN	600
I Legitimacy	600
A. Introduction	600
Green and Winters, The Ontario Legitimacy Act	600
Family Law Reform Act, 1976	602
Succession Law Reform Act, 1976	604
The Legitimacy Act	605
Children's Law Reform Act, 1977	606
B. Proving and disproving parenthood	607
(1) Where the parents are married to each other	607
(a) Blood tests	607
F. v. F.	607
(b) Artificial insemination	610
People of California v. Sorensen	610
(2) In special proceedings	611
The Child Welfare Act	611
Re Kuchera and Menduk	615
Re Milner	619
(3) Children's Law Reform Act of 1977	621
II Custody	624
A. Disputes between parents	624
(1) The legislative framework	624
The Infants Act	624
Habeas Corpus Act	625
The Deserted Wives and Children's Maintenance Act	626
Family Law Reform Act, 1976	628

	<u>Page</u>
The Divorce Act	630
The Matrimonial Causes Act	631
(2) The general principles	632
Child Custody, Foster and Freed	632
Katkin, Bullington & Levine, <i>Above and Beyond the Best Interests of the Child</i>	638
Mnookin, <i>Child-Custody Adjudication</i>	648
Summary of Discussions, Panel on Custody, Ontario Branch of Can. Bar Assoc.	673
Re Fulford and Townshend	677
Woodburn	679
(3) Where the child is legitimate	681
(a) Interim custody	681
Dyment	681
(b) Permanent custody	683
In Re T. (Infants)	683
Cochrane	685
Kruger v. Brooker	688
Hayre	692
Case	694
Macdonald	698
Talsky	703
In Re K	715
Romeyko	720
Reid	722
Rowe	728
Wakaluk	732
(4) Where the child is illegitimate	736
Re Vandenberg and Guimond	736
Re Logue and Burrell	738
B. Disputes between a parent and third parties	740
(1) Where the third party is a natural person	740
Hepton v. Maat	740
J. v. C.	742
Moores & Feldstein	746
Wiltshire	753
Re Perry	755
Re Flynn	760
(2) Where the third party is the state or a state agency	761
(a) State intervention: The "pure welfare" approach	761
Manson, <i>The Ontario Child Welfare Act of 1965</i>	761
The Child Welfare Act	768
Richardson, <i>Children's Aid Society</i>	780
Department of Social and Family Services Annual Report for Fiscal Year Ending March, 1971	785
Re Dubeau	788
Gingell v. The Queen	790
Re Milner	792
Ex Parte D	797
Re Brady Infants	802
Paulsen, <i>Child Abuse Reporting Laws: The Shape of the Legislation</i>	804
Note, <i>The Custody Question and Child Neglect Re-hearings</i>	808
Re Cordes-Saathoff et al. and C.C.A.S. of Metro Toronto	814

	<u>Page</u>
(b) State intervention: the quasi-welfare approach	817
Green, Trumpets, Justice and Federalism: An Analysis of the Ontario Training Schools Act of 1965	817
The Juvenile Delinquents Act	822
The Training Schools Act	824
C. Custody and guardianship after death of natural guardian	826
The Infants Act	826
Scott	827
III Access	828
Ader	828
Smith v. Painter	833
Re Tuohimaki	834
IV Adoption	835
A. The statutory scheme	835
The Child Welfare Act	835
Smith & Dick, Recent Changes in Ontario Adoption Legislation	840
B. Consent of natural parents	842
O'Connor v. A. & B.	842
Re Roebuck	845
Re Leduc	847
Re Winsor	848
Re Sobering et al. and Sergeant	851
Mugford v. Children's Aid Society of Ottawa	853
Metro Toronto C.A.S. v. Lyttle	857
C. The religious factor	862
Petch, Re Lamb	862
Re Lee	765
D. Access	867
Re S	867
V. The Parent-Child Relationship	869
A. Parental control	869
Ontario Law Reform Commission, Report on the Age of Majority 62 (1969)	869
Age of Majority and Accountability Act	870
Re D	871
B. Economic relations	874
(1) Parental obligations to child	874
(a) General	874
Ontario Law Reform Commission, Report on the Age of Majority	874
Children's Maintenance Act	876
Family Law Reform Act, 1976	877
The Criminal Code	880
The Child Welfare Act	881
Infants Act	881

The Deserted Wives' and Children's Maintenance Act	882
The Matrimonial Causes Act	883
The Divorce Act	884
Clark	886
Hock	888
Proctor	889
Devolution of Estates Act	891
The Dependents Relief Act	894
Succession Law Reform Act, 1976	896
Re Pfrimmer	902
Walls v. Hanson	903
(b) Obligations to the illegitimate child	904
Re Kelso and Duncan	904
Re Vickell	905
(2) The child's duty to maintain his parents	906
Parents' Maintenance Act	906
Family Law Reform Act, 1976	907
 CHAPTER SIX: PROTECTION OF THE FAMILY UNIT AGAINST INTERFERENCE BY THIRD PARTIES	909
I Between Husband and Wife	909
A. Intentional interference	909
Kelly, "The Case for Retention of Action for In- tentional Interference with the Marital Re- lationship"	914
B. Negligent interference	918
Canestraro v. Larade	918
Leaphart and McCann "Consortium: An Action for the Wife"	921
Ontario Law Reform Commission, Report on Family Law Part I: Torts	926
Family Law Reform Act, 1976	928
II Between Parent and Child	928
Ontario Law Reform Commission, Report on Family Law Part I: Torts	928
Family Law Reform Act, 1975	930
The Seduction Act	931
Family Law Reform Act, 1976	931

